Nixa Public Works
1111 W. Kathryn
Nixa, Missouri 65714
417-725-2353
www.nixa.com

To: Brian Bingle
From: Doug Colvin
Cc: Sharon Hankison, Brian Denney
Date: November 15, 2016
RE: Electric Department Salary Grade and Pay Adjustment Proposal

As we have discussed over the years, obtaining and keeping a staff of quality electric lineworkers is the single biggest issue hindering departmental operations. Much like the problems which the Police Department experiences, we simply cannot compete for these employees who require a significant amount of training and are not readily available to begin with. Also akin to the Police problem is the fact that this is a national problem that spans many skilled labor areas. The combination of high demand and our inability to compete with other agencies that can attract and keep them satisfied by offering better pay and/or benefits is overwhelming. The one difference between the electric and police departments however is that our competition is not from other governmental agencies but are with the regional co-op or private sector utilities and line contractors. These agencies are stand-alone utilities that are not bound by pay grades or scales that must balance across numerous departments and a long list of job descriptions.

In recent years we have created a new grade for the Lineworker position (and a few others) in an effort to solve this issue. Unfortunately, that effort also fell short because we continued the historical practice to use only local municipal hourly rate comparisons and not regional comparisons or anything from the private sector which is where our competition is. Therefore, the wages were still woefully uncompetitive and our efforts unsuccessful. Our next step (in 2013) was to make an adjustment to begin offering new lineworkers a starting wage of $25.00/hr (currently $25.75). Since then, we have been able to hire one fully qualified lineworker and attracted three apprentices who already had a couple years training under their belt. Today, none of those employees are with us and the three graduated apprentices left for a much higher hourly rate even though they were required to reimburse us their training cost. In the last six years, we have lost no less than 5 graduated apprentices for this very reason.

We have been advertising nonstop for an open lineworker position (currently 2) for as long as I can remember and have only been fully staffed for a couple short periods since I began my career here in 2004; the most recent was a few months in 2011. We periodically get an application or inquiry for employment by qualified persons however the lack of a competitive starting wage and lack of upward growth is stymied by the maximum cap of our grade which is only $1.97 from our entry point. As mentioned above, we raised the entry wage offering but didn't update our pay grade for the position. This was the case with the most recent and very qualified applicant we offered a position to; he was happy to take a pay cut from his current employer and relocate here for the entry wage but in the end would not commit because he was capped at such a low rate for his level of experience.

Currently we have two qualified lineworkers, two apprentice lineworkers are finishing their third year and should be fully qualified in early 2018. Two vacant positions remain as they have for the past year or two. This lack of qualified employees is taking a toll on the department both the system itself and the personnel. By not being able to do sufficient maintenance work, we will begin losing ground on our efforts to keep a high quality service record. We have had to increase contract work over the past couple of years to keep up with the critical replacements on distribution circuit facilities because we are needed for outage or crisis work or our crew size is simply too small for the job at hand.

The toll on existing employees is much like that in the PD where burn out can and does occur. Having just a handful of employees only allows for a very short rotation between being available to take emergency service calls. These individuals are serving over a week per month on-call as well as assisting others on off weeks, month after month which requires them to be ready at a moment's notice to come in and solve problems. We have been utilizing apprentices for the on-call to help the situation but most work requires them to call in a fully qualified lineworker to assist.

We need to make a drastic change in order to attract and keep a full staff of quality lineworkers. To that end, I have worked to gather some additional information from our national association as well as from a couple of local co-ops to assist in supporting what we have experienced and what is needed to correct our issue. The attached spread sheet (Attachment A) includes information from Mrs. Hankison's recent salary survey which includes local Missouri municipal utilities, plus the additional data I was able to gather on a more regional basis from the American Public Power Association and current hourly pay data from local IOU, Co-ops and a line contractor gathered by Brian Denney. Attachment A data covers comparisons for the Electric department only.

The revised average rates include regional 1st and 3rd quartile salary ranges for utilities of our size both nationally and in the south-central region by APPA. I also included columns for the mean and median averages for the same. The mean and median numbers have not been calculated in the overall average rather along with the local utilities averages. When applied to the recent Nixa survey, the quartile minimum and maximums for Lineworker would increase to $28.26-$34.67 per hour which is somewhat higher than what we have been offering on the low end and considerably higher on the top cap. The local competition grade averages for Lineworker are higher from $35.60 to $39.20. The average salary for our local competition is $36.04 for Lineworkers and $26.52 for Apprentices. Some, but not all, of these are union positions that are set by contract; it should be noted however that we have lost employees to five of the eight listed.

Provided we were to simply raise the Lineworker wage again, we quickly run over the top of the scale which also needs corrected. The ripple effect of another grade change is considerable since the grades for all city departments are rolled together in a single schedule (this Lineworker grade would fall between our current grade 11 and grade 12). The change would not only affect pay grades above the Lineworker position within the department, it has considerable effect on other departments positions and nearly all supervisory and management jobs in the organization. Adjusting all positons and/or grades is nearly impossible for numerous reasons. Cost is obviously the biggest factor but most all of the other organizational positions in theses grades are correctly placed based on Mrs. Hankison's recent survey.

Though we've talked about creating a separate grade scale for the electric or utility departments, we have never really looked closely at what would entail. Therefore, I've created a new grade scale proposal that includes only Electric. This new scale (Attachment B) lists the new grades for electric

alongside the other Public Works departments for reference. The proposal covers the increases necessary to adjust the existing employees into the grade and make way for the open lineworker positions. As far as additional cost to the 2017 budget, this proposal would increase the salary line item approximately $87,000. I mention approximate because I've figured only the rough salary difference and assumed we would fill the two vacant positions in April.

In addition to the Lineworker adjustment, there are two positions above that, including the Superintendent and Asst. Superintendent that I've increased accordingly and I have also recommended a change for the Apprentice position to separate it from the ground worker and get closer to the start point of the Lineworker. Finally, I have moved the Substation Tech in relation to the Lineworker as we have done in the past which is also consistent with the survey data. All other departmental positions including, Ground Worker, Equipment Operator, Utility Worker and Tree Trimmer jobs could all remain at their current levels but within the new scale. My final recommendation is that we move the Superintendent to exempt status and make that position salaried which is in line with others at that level in the organization.

I can only imagine how this will be perceived by the rest of the organization as it ranks the top three positions in the department as comparable (or above) with the management level of the rest of the organization (Attachment C). I do however believe that a change of this magnitude is our only option to get out of the current situation and be able to compete for the quality employees we need to keep Nixa's electric utility at the level it is.

Attachment A

JOB TITLE	APPA Compable Job Desc/Title	By Revenue Class 15-25M 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median by Revenue Class 15-25M	By Customer Size 10-20k 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median By Customer Size 10-20k	Region - South-Central** 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary Median/ Mean	National Median average Union vs Non-Union	RegionalREC Salaries by Revenue Class	Regional REC Salaries by Customer Size	Local Co-ops Average	Avg from Nixa Survey Update 2016	Regional Average 1QT/3QT and Nixa Survey	Average local Coops and Regional medians	PAR	Show-Me	KAMO	South-west	Empire	Ozark	White River	CU
Electric Supt Min	**Line Div Supt.**	$38.47	$42.51	$42.48	$46.26	$39.80	$37.96	$44.71		$50.20	$51.63		$27.20	$38.44									
Electric Supt Max		$45.20		$52.64		$52.43	$52.82	$46.30		$62.11	$55.96		$39.66	$48.18									
Asst. Electric Supt Min	**Construction Supt.**	$33.92	$35.08	$37.75	$40.36	$36.07	$36.35	$41.21		*	*		$19.97	$34.21									
Ass. Electric Supt Max		$42.55		$44.39		$42.82	$48.28	$42.63		*	*		$28.34	$41.50									
Substation Tech - Min	**Substation Tech**	*	$35.19	$32.73	$37.21	$31.30	$29.26	$35.56	$41.01	*	*		$19.10	$28.10									
Substation Tech - Max		*		$41.99		$37.91	$41.38	$35.50	$32.57	*	*		$26.97	$37.06									
Electrical Lineworker Min	**Journey Lineworker**	$30.17	$33.55	$32.12	$35.31	$30.58	$29.34	$34.11	$36.76	*	*	**$38.56**	**$19.10**	**$28.26**	**$37.35**	$42.87	$40.00	$35.61	$34.90	$39.59	$35.85	$42.24	$37.41
Electrical Lineworker Max		$36.29		$38.00		$35.61	$37.65	$33.50	$31.75	*	*		**$26.97**	**$34.67**									
Apprentice Lineworker Min	**App. Lineman**	$22.07	$25.75	$22.89	$25.70	$22.19	$21.56	$25.43	$27.73	*	*	**$26.89**	**$15.33**	**$21.58**	**$26.60**	$25.72	$25.71		$26.09	$27.72		$29.93	$26.19
Apprentice Lineworker Max		$30.25		$30.52		$27.41	$30.36	$25.93	$23.76	*	*		$21.52	$27.67									
Groundwkr/Equip Opr Min	**App. Lineman**	$22.07	$25.75	$22.89	$25.70	$22.19	$21.56	$25.43	*	*	*		$15.33	$21.58									
Groundwkr/Equip Opr Max		$30.25		$30.52		$27.41	$30.36	$25.93	*	*	*		$21.52	$27.67									
Tree Trimmer I Min	**Tree Foreman**	*	$24.24	$25.66	$29.30	$25.80	$25.13	$29.10	$38.58	*	*		$12.91	$23.72									
Tree Trimmer I Max		*		$31.56		$37.10	$38.20	$31.52	$28.51	*	*		$18.12	$31.30									
Tree Trimmer II Min	**Journey Tree Trimmer**	*	*	$19.44	$21.12	*	$20.37	$23.50	$27.63	*	*		$16.64	$19.99									
Tree Trimmer II Max		*		$24.50		*	$29.01	$24.87	$20.93	*	*		$23.17	$25.39									

Green cells represent APPA survey category as Management/Exempt positions - Nixa are not catagorized as exempt

Orange cells represent APPA survey category as hourly positions

* Less than 5 respondents so no entry provided

** South-Central Region includes the states of Kansas, Louisiana, Missouri Nebraska, Oklahoma and Texas

Positions highlighted in Gold are in in addition to those in green or orange; all within the "Ripple Effect" from Lineman adjustments on the existing grade scale.

Attachment B

2017 PUBLIC WORKS EMPLOYEE DATA SHEET									
			Proposed	2017	2017			Hourly	Annual
	Hire	Pay	1/1/2017	Pay Scale	Pay Scale			Adjustment	Adjustment
Position	**Date**	**Grade**	**Budget**	**Min.**	**Max.**	**+/- Max.**	**Notes**	Increase	Increase
Public Works - Admin/Other Shared									
Public Works Director	04.29.04	C-12		$31.01	$45.68				
Administrative Assistant	03.14.11	C-5	$15.00	$13.04	$18.31	$3.31			
PW Inspector	12.12.94	C-9	$22.58	$20.17	$28.61	$6.03			
PW Inspector Asst.	03.09.09	C-6	$17.94	$15.47	$21.73	$3.79			
Maintenance Coordinator	06.20.07	C-6	$18.29	$15.47	$21.73	$3.44			
Maintenance Utility Worker	3.31.10	C-5	$15.20	$13.04	$18.31	$3.11			
PW Janitor/Bldg. Maint	12.11.13	C-4	$12.13	$12.10	$17.26	$5.13			
Purchasing Manager	02.20.13	C-8	$21.04	$19.29	$27.24	$6.20			
Electric									
Electric Superintendent	06.22.98	U-11 (<C-13)	$38.00	$36.75	$48.25	$10.25	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$2.10	$4,368.00
Asst. Electric Supt.	06.17.09	U-10 (>C-12)	$34.50	$33.25	$45.50	$11.00	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$5.89	$12,251.20
Lineworker	10.01.05	U-9 (<C-12)	$32.50	$30.50	$42.25	$9.75	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$5.71	$11,876.80
Lineworker	vacant	U-9 (<C-12)	$30.50	$30.50	$42.25	$11.75	New Utility Pay Grade Scale 3/4 of 2017	$4.75	$7,410.00
Lineworker	vacant	U-9 (<C-12)	$30.50	$30.50	$42.25	$11.75	New Utility Pay Grade Scale 3/4 of 2017	$4.75	$7,410.00
Lineworker	03.08.07	U-9 (<C-12)	$31.00	$30.50	$42.25	$11.25	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$5.25	$10,920.00
Apprentice Lineworker	04.16.08	U-8 (<C-8)	$21.50	$21.50	$29.00	$7.50	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$4.92	$10,233.60
Apprentice Lineworker	02.12.14	U-8 (<C-8)	$21.50	$21.50	$29.00	$7.50	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$4.92	$10,233.60
Groundworker/Equipment OP	06.02.97	U-6 (=C-6)	$20.86	$15.47	$21.73	$0.87	New Utility Pay Grade Scale		
Groundworker/Equipment OP	11.01.00	U-6 (=C-6)	$20.36	$15.47	$21.73	$1.37	New Utility Pay Grade Scale		
Substation Tech	06.06.07	U-9 (<C-12)	$32.00	$30.50	$42.25	$10.25	New Utility Pay Grade Scale	$5.99	$12,459.20
Tree Trimmer II	vacant	U-7 (=C-7)	$16.80	$16.80	$23.40	$6.60	New Utility Pay Grade Scale		
Tree Trimmer I	10.01.13	U-5 (=C-5)	$15.19	$13.04	$18.31	$3.12	New Utility Pay Grade Scale		$87,162.40
Tree Trimmer I	10.30.13	U-5 (=C-5)	$13.91	$13.04	$18.31	$4.40	New Utility Pay Grade Scale		
Water Quality - Water Div.									
Water Quality Superintendent	02.10.10	C-11	$33.72	$27.47	$40.06	$6.34			
Asst. WQS - Water	05.21.01	C-9	$23.59	$20.17	$28.61	$5.02			
Lead Water Operator	03.22.06	C-7	$18.51	$16.80	$23.40	$4.89			
Water Operator	08.23.07	C-6	$16.00	$15.47	$21.73	$5.73			
Water Operator	05.02.98	C-6	$20.09	$15.47	$21.73	$1.64			
Utility Worker	11.09.15	C-5	$13.04	$13.04	$18.31	$5.27			
Water Quality - Wastewater Collection/Treatment & Recycle									
Asst. WQS - Wastewater	08.14.00	C-9	$25.03	$20.17	$28.61	$3.58			
Lead WW Plant Operator	vacant	C-7	$16.80	$16.80	$23.40	$6.60			
WW Plant Operator/Tech	03.05.08	C-6	$18.18	$15.47	$21.73	$3.55			
WW Plant Operator	vacant	C-6	$15.47	$15.47	$21.73	$6.26	Holding for K. Farris promotion		
Utility Worker	07.05.16	C-5	$13.04	$13.04	$18.31	$5.27			
Utility Worker	6/6/2015	C-5	$13.30	$13.04	$18.31	$5.01			
Lead Utility Worker - WW Collection	10.01.08	C-6	$17.81	$15.47	$21.73	$3.92			
Utility Worker - WW Collection	05.11.05	C-5	$18.25	$13.04	$18.31	$0.06			
Utility Worker - WW Collection	03.26.14	C-5	$14.72	$13.04	$18.31	$3.59			
Utility Worker - WW Collection	04.16.13	C-5	$14.47	$13.04	$18.31	$3.84			
Utility Worker - Recycle	04.14.16	C-5	$13.04	$13.04	$18.31	$5.27			
Utility Worker - Recycle	08.17.05	C-5	$15.18	$13.04	$18.31	$3.13			
Street									
Street Superintendent	03.24.08	C-10	$26.78	$23.02	$33.05	$6.27			
Assistant Street Supt.	11.23.15	C-9	$20.17	$20.17	$28.61	$8.44			
Lead Utility Worker	07.13.15	C-6	$17.48	$15.47	$21.73	$4.25			
Utility Worker/Equip. Operator	02.20.08	C-6	$16.48	$15.47	$21.73	$5.25			
Utility Worker	12.19.04	C-5	$18.86	$13.04	$18.31	-$0.55			
Utility Worker	05.07.12	C-5	$13.64	$13.04	$18.31	$4.67			
Utility Worker	10.04.04	C-5	$14.67	$13.04	$18.31	$3.64			
Utility Worker	05.07.12	C-5	$13.64	$13.04	$18.31	$4.67			
Utility Worker	08.28.13	C-5	$13.04	$13.04	$18.31	$5.27			
Utility Worker (BGM supervisor)	09.21.05	C-6	$16.27	$15.47	$21.73	$5.46			
Buildings/Grounds Maint	08.21.13	C-4	$12.33	$12.10	$17.26	$4.93			
Buildings/Grounds Maint	05.06.13	C-4	$12.60	$12.10	$17.26	$4.66			
Buildings/Grounds Maint	07.20.15	C-4	$12.10	$12.10	$17.26	$5.16			

Existing Grade	JOB TITLE	APPA Compable Job Desc/Title	By Revenue Class 15-25M 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median by Revenue Class 15-25M	By Customer Size 10-20k 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median By Customer Size 10-20k	Region - South-Central** 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary Median/ Mean	National Median average Union vs Non-Union	RegionalREC Salaries by Revenue Class	Regional REC Salaries by Customer Size	Local Co-ops Average	Avg from Nixa Survey Update 2016	Regional Average 1QT/3QT and Nixa Survey	Average local Coops and Regional medians
13	**City Administrator Min**	**General Manager**	$122,013	$127,130	$141,907	$164,775	$135,000	$107,081	$145,000		$124,479	$144,720		$77,807	$121,468.00	
	City Administrator Max		$178,390		$192,277		$225,000	$193,027	$159,221		$180,782	$190,718		$110,837	$176,458.67	
	City Attorney Min													$0		
	City Attorney Max													$0		
10	City Clerk Min													$47,401		
	City Clerk Max													$68,064		
6	Deputy City Clerk Min													$31,878		
	Deputy City Clerk Max													$44,757		
6	Court Administrator Min													$31,878		
	Court Administrator Max													$44,757		
5	Court Clerk Min													$26,846		
	Court Clerk Max													$37,669		
10	**Director of Comm. - Min**	**Comm Director**	$61,990	*	$63,992	$79,890	$60,230	$70,632	$92,771		*	*		$47,401	$66,169.33	
	Director of Comm. -Max		$95,783		$94,309		$123,850	$114,375	$96,690		*	*		$68,064	$98,845.17	
	Director of Econ Dev - Min													$0		
	Director of Econ Dev - Max													$0		
11	**Director of Finance Min**	**Chief Financial Officer**	$80,938	$94,422	$92,164	$110,640	$98,172	$84,224	$105,364		$77,743	$88,645		$56,570	$86,238.67	
	Director of Finance Max		$100,886		$124,662		$129,570	$135,674	$115,625		$106,185	$116,821		$82,499	$114,819.33	
11	**Director of HR Min**	**Dir of HR**	$55,447	$60,200	$75,501	$91,900	$85,030	$77,821	$95,790		*	*		$47,401	$72,831.67	
	Director of HR Max		$72,593		$101,451		$125,486	$122,896	$113,754		*	*		$68,064	$100,707.33	
10	Director of Parks & Rec Min													$47,401		
	Director of Parks & Rec Max													$68,064		
11	Director of Plng & Dev Min													$56,570		
	Director of Plng & Dev Max													$82,499		
12	**Director of Public Works Min**	**Asst. General Manager**	$94,848	*	$103,787	$127,125	$130,198	$94,325	$126,408		$106,807	$105,916		$63,862	$102,238.00	
	Director of Public Works Max		$129,750		$146,071		$183,654	$164,796	$132,379		$119,483	$122,438		$94,078	$141,788.00	
	Director of Tech - Min													$0		
	Director of Tech - Max													$0		
9	Systems Network Tech - Min													$41,537		
	Systems Network Tech - Max													$58,937		
11	Water Quality Supt Min													$47,401		
	Water Quality Supt Max													$68,064		
9	Asst Street Supt Min													$41,537		
	Asst Street Supt Max													$58,937		
9	Asst Wtr Qlty Sup-Wtr Div Min													$41,537		
	Asst Wtr Qlty Sup-Wtr Div Max													$58,937		
9	Asst Wtr Qlty Sup-WW Div Min													$41,537		
	Asst Wtr Qulty sup-WW Div Max													$58,937		
10	Street Supt Min													$47,401		
	Street Supt Max													$68,064		
11	**Electric Supt Min**	**Line Div Supt.**	$38.47	$42.51	$42.48	$46.26	$39.80	$37.96	$44.71		$50.20	$51.63		$27.20	$38.44	
	Electric Supt Max		$45.20		$52.64		$52.43	$52.82	$46.30		$62.11	$55.96		$39.66	$48.18	
10	**Asst. Electric Supt Min**	**Construction Supt.**	$33.92	$35.08	$37.75	$40.36	$36.07	$36.35	$41.21		*	*		$19.97	$34.21	
	Ass. Electric Supt Max		$42.55		$44.39		$42.82	$48.28	$42.63		*	*		$28.34	$41.50	
8	Business&Mkt Mgr - Min													$39,724		
	Business&Mkt Mgr - Max													$56,101		
9	Asst Director Parks & Rec - Min													$41,537		
	Asst Director Parks & Rec Max													$58,937		
6	Lead Accounting Clerk Min													$31,878		
	Lead Accounting Clerk Max													$44,757		
8	**Purchasing Manager Min**	**Purchasing Dir**	$57,774	*	$66,778	$74,304	$57,640	$82,665	$83,485		*	*		$39,724	$64,677.67	
	Purchasing Manager Max		$75,276		$87,839		$92,512	$101,684	$84,403		*	*		$56,101	$82,969.17	
5	Accounting Clerk-AP /AR Min													$26,846		
	Accounting Clerk-AP /AR Max													$37,699		
5	Accounting Clerk - AR Min													$26,846		
	Accounting Clerk -AR Max													$37,669		
5	Accounting Clerk - Auditor Min													$26,846		
	Accounting Clerk - Auditor Max													$37,699		

Existing Grade	JOB TITLE	APPA Compable Job Desc/Title	By Revenue Class 15-25M 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median by Revenue Class 15-25M	By Customer Size 10-20k 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median By Customer Size 10-20k	Region - South-Central** 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary Median/ Mean	National Median average Union vs Non-Union	RegionalREC Salaries by Revenue Class	Regional REC Salaries by Customer Size	Local Co-ops Average	Avg from Nixa Survey Update 2016	Regional Average 1QT/3QT and Nixa Survey	Average local Coops and Regional medians
4	Utility Account Specialist Min													$24,905		
	Utility Account Specialist Max													$35,546		
5	Utility Account Specialist II Min													$26,846		
	Utility Account Specialist II Max													$37,699		
9	Utility Account Spec Supv Min													$41,537		
	Utility Account Spec Supv Max													$58,937		
5	Utility Wkr / Meter Reader Min	Meter Reader	$17.46	$19.98	$19.96	$22.92	$15.87	$15.77	$20.33	$24.20	*	*		$12.91		
	Utility Wkr/ Meter Reader Max		$23.89		$24.84		$23.18	$24.15	$20.31	$16.80	*	*		$18.12		
5	Utility Wkr/Metr Reader (locato	Locator		$24.01	$21.30	$25.23	$21.50	$22.64	$24.86	$27.74	*	*		$13.41		
	Utility Wkr/Metr Reader (locator)	Max			$30.45		$32.42	$29.73	$26.42	$23.64	*	*		$18.62		
3	Receptionist Min													$22,346		
	Receptionist Max													$32,368		
4	Clerk/Receptionist Min													$24,905		
	Clerk/Receptionist Max													$35,546		
4	Secretary Min													$24,905		
	Secretary Max													$35,546		
5	Administrative Asst Min													$26,846		
	Administrative Asst Max													$37,699		
5	Administrative Asst HR Min													$0		
	Administrative Asst HR Max													$0		
	Admin Clerk - Min													$26,846		
	Admin Clerk - Max													$37,699		
	Guest Services Sp - Min													$24,905		
	Guest Services Sp-Max													$35,546		
4	Building/Grounds Maint Min													$24,905		
	Building/Grounds Maint Max													$35,546		
4	Building Maint Min													$24,905		
	Building Maint Max													$35,546		
4	Groundskeeper/Maint Min													$24,905		
	Groundskeeper/Maint Max													$35,546		
5	Maint/Utility Worker Min													$26,846		
	Maint/Utility Worker Max													$37,699		
5	Recreation Spec I Min													$26,846		
	Recreation Spec I Max													$37,699		
6	Recreation Spec II Min													$31,878		
	Recreation Spec II Max													$44,757		
7	Rec Supvr health & fitness Min													$34,607		
	Rec Supvr health & fitness Max													$48,190		
	Police Clerk - Evidence Min													$0		
	Police Clerk - Evidence Max													$0		
4	Police Clerk - Min													$24,905		
	Police Clerk - Max													$35,546		
5	Community Service Ofcr Min													$26,846		
	Community Service Ofcr Max													$37,699		
11	Police Chief Min													$56,570		
	Police Chief Max													$82,499		
	Police Captain Min													$0		
	Police Captain Max													$0		
7	Police Corporal Min													$34,607		
	Police Corporal Max													$48,190		
10	Police Lieutenant Min													$47,401		
	Police Lieutenant Max													$68,064		
9	Police Sergeant Min													$41,537		
	Police Sergeant Max													$58,937		
6	Police Officer Min													$31,878		
	Police Officer Max													$44,757		
6	Police Officer Invest Min													$32,918		$35.67
	Police Officer Invest Max													$45,797		$39.20

Existing Grade	JOB TITLE	APPA Compable Job Desc/Title	By Revenue Class 15-25M 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median by Revenue Class 15-25M	By Customer Size 10-20k 1st Qt/3rd Qt	Median By Customer Size 10-20k	Region - South-Central** 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary 1st Qt/3rd Qt	National Summary Median/ Mean	National Median average Union vs Non-Union	RegionalREC Salaries by Revenue Class	Regional REC Salaries by Customer Size	Local Co-ops Average	Avg from Nixa Survey Update 2016	Regional Average 1QT/3QT and Nixa Survey	Average local Coops and Regional medians
8	**Substation Tech - Min**	**Substation Tech**	*	$35.19	$32.73	$37.21	$31.30	$29.26	$35.56	$41.01	*	*		$19.10	$28.10	
	Substation Tech - Max		*		$41.99		$37.91	$41.38	$35.50	$32.57	*	*		$26.97	$37.06	
8	**Electrical Lineworker Min**	**Journey Lineworker**	$30.17	$33.55	$32.12	$35.31	$30.58	$29.34	$34.11	$36.76	*	*	**$38.56**	**$19.10**	**$28.26**	**$37.35**
	Electrical Lineworker Max		$36.29		$38.00		$35.61	$37.65	$33.50	$31.75	*	*		**$26.97**	**$34.67**	
6	**Apprentice Lineworker Min**	**App. Lineman**	$22.07	$25.75	$22.89	$25.70	$22.19	$21.56	$25.43	$27.73	*	*	**$26.89**	**$15.33**	**$21.58**	**$26.60**
	Apprentice Lineworker Max		$30.25		$30.52		$27.41	$30.36	$25.93	$23.76	*	*		$21.52	$27.67	
6	**Groundwkr/Equip Opr Min**	**App. Lineman**	$22.07	$25.75	$22.89	$25.70	$22.19	$21.56	$25.43	*	*	*		$15.33	$21.58	
	Groundwkr/Equip Opr Max		$30.25		$30.52		$27.41	$30.36	$25.93	*	*	*		$21.52	$27.67	
5	**Tree Trimmer I Min**	**Tree Foreman**	*	$24.24	$25.66	$29.30	$25.80	$25.13	$29.10	$38.58	*	*		$12.91	$23.72	
	Tree Trimmer I Max		*		$31.56		$37.10	$38.20	$31.52	$28.51	*	*		$18.12	$31.30	
6	**Tree Trimmer II Min**	**Journey Tree Trimmer**	*	*	$19.44	$21.12	*	$20.37	$23.50	$27.63	*	*		$16.64	$19.99	
	Tree Trimmer II Max		*		$24.50		*	$29.01	$24.87	$20.93	*	*		$23.17	$25.39	
6	GIS Technician Min													$31,878		
	GIS Technician Max													$44,757		
6	Planner I Min													$31,878		
	Planner I Max													$44,757		
7	Planner II Min													$34,607		
	Planner II Max													$48,190		
7	Building Inspector Min													$34,607		
	Building Inspector Max													$48,190		
9	Sr Building Inspector Min													$41,537		
	Sr Building Inspector Max													$58,937		
9	Sr Planner Min													$41,537		
	Sr Planner Max													$58,937		
6	Planning & Dev Code Adm Min													$31,878		
	Planning & Dev Code Adm Max													$44,757		
6	Preventive Maint Coord Min	**Fleet Mechanic**	$23.96	$24.89		$26.97	$21.43	$22.79	$22.79	$31.74	*	*		$15.33		
	Preventive Maint Coord Max		$30.28				$30.81	$32.95	$28.01	$23.06	*	*		$21.52		
9	Public Works Inspector Min													$41,537		
	Public Works Inspector Max													$58,937		
5	Utility Worker Min													$26,846		
	Utility Worker Max													$37,699		
6	Recycle Center Coord Min													$31,878		
	Recycle Center coord Max													$44,757		
5	WW Maint/Utility Worker Min													$26,846		
	WW Maint/Utility Worker Max													$37,699		
6	WW Plant Opr I Min													$31,878		
	WW Plant Opr I Max													$44,757		
6	Laboratory Tech Min													$31,878		
	Laboratory Tech Max													$44,757		
6	Lead Utility Worker WW Coll Min													$31,878		
	Lead Utility Worker WW Coll Max													$44,757		
6	Lead Utility Worker Eqp Opr Min													$31,878		
	Lead Utility Worker Eqp Opr Max													$44,757		
7	Lead WW Plant Opr Min													$34,607		
	Lead WW Plant Opr Max													$48,190		
7	Lead Water System Opr Min													$34,607		
	Lead Water System Opr Max													$48,190		
6	Water System Opr Min													$31,878		
	Water System Opr Max													$44,757		
7	Water System Opr/Elec Tech Min													$34,607		
	Water System Opr/Elec Tech Max													$48,190		

Green cells represent APPA survey category as Management/Exempt positions - Nixa are not catagorized as exempt

Orange cells represent APPA survey category as hourly positions

* Less than 5 respondents so no entry provided

** South-Central Region includes the states of Kansas, Louisiana, Missouri Nebraska, Oklahoma and Texas

Positions highlighted in Gold are in in addition to those in green or orange; all within the "Ripple Effect" from Lineman adjustments on the existing grade scale

Five Myths About Pay That Are Killing Your Utility

By Carl Mycoff, Managing Director, Mycoff, Fry & Prouse LLC - Posted on August 9, 2016 by APPA Staff

When I was in high school, drivers' education was a required course. The course included an Ohio State Police video showing the impact of crashes, to frighten adolescent drivers. I still remember what I learned from it — the most important part of a car is the driver.

A critical component of finding the right drivers for your utility is proper compensation.

Public power decision makers are constantly evaluating the costs and benefits of capital investments and equipment. However, hiring the right drivers is often based on emotion or politics. Utilities that take a logical, measured approach to hiring and pay experience better performance. It isn't just about money — it's really about the allocation of limited resources.

In my 45 years of recruiting, I've heard so many reasons why public power utilities should not pay competitively. Here are the top five myths and reasons to dispel them.

Myth: A public power utility can't pay competitively because it's a government or not-for-profit agency.

Public power utilities are not-for-profit entities, but it is wrong to think that they do not create a return for their communities. Public power utilities often offer lower rates and put revenues directly back into the community.

If the utility is a city department, there's the myth that utility employees should be paid comparably to other city employees. But there are two huge flaws in this logic.

First, a city is largely a consortium of cost-based services for which the citizens have no competing offering. The utility is a revenue-based service providing net income. The public power utility has a ready competitor in the form of the neighboring investor-owned utility — not to mention new technologies such as rooftop solar power and home energy storage. The utility also often has the ability to generate additional revenue through innovative business, such as wholesale power market transactions and ancillary services.

Second, the supply of personnel with city administration skills matches the demand for those services at market compensation levels. But market compensation for utility experience is on a different curve. For example, municipally owned hospitals do not pay surgeons and anesthesiologists on the same level as city managers or other city administrators. The consequence is obvious. The citizens of Green Bay own the Green Bay Packers but I'm am certain the quarterback, Aaron Rogers, does not have his pay measured by how much the city administrators earn.

Personnel costs represent about 20 percent of a utility's total costs. Increasing pay by 10 percent for all employees would result in only a 2 percent impact on the typical utility bill — a small price to pay to keep the lights on.

Myth: A public power utility is a monopoly and not subject to competition.

I hear the argument time and time again — consumers don't have the option to choose a utility because most utility service territory is a monopoly. But consumers can choose where they live!

Being a "monopoly" does not make the utility immune to the marketplace.

Successful utilities don't get much attention, but failures always make the news — outages, equipment failures, or dramatic rate increases. Customers that are unhappy with community-owned utilities can storm the castle with pitchforks and torches and elect new politicians.

Public power is not insulated from competition for intellectual capital, either. Many public power utilities can tell you how their prized lineworkers, engineers, accountants, marketing personnel and seasoned leaders are recruited away by cooperative or investor-owned utilities. Utility employees are a limited resource — and they can and will work in competing sectors.

Myth: Public power is too small to compete with neighboring utilities.

In the 1980s, investor-owned utilities, faced with the certainty of deregulation, abandoned the practice of abundant hiring and training. The resource pool of trained utility personnel declined dramatically as a result. In fact, about 60 percent of utility personnel today are baby boomers headed to retirement. To meet the demand for trained personnel, public power, cooperatives, and investor-owned utilities all compete for now even more limited human resources.

Increased demand for a limited resource will force its price to increase. Failure to recruit and retain properly trained personnel has obvious consequences. For community leaders faced with the need to provide a vital service at the lowest possible cost (and with a return that offsets other costs), paying for top talent is a no-brainer.

Myth: Competitive pay is politically unacceptable in my community.

Public power serves affluent as well as poor communities. Affluent and growing communities have an abundance of customers with high loads that provide high-paying jobs. Disadvantaged communities are usually experiencing declining loads and populations.

Affluent and growing communities must select utility leaders and staff who will ensure a trajectory of increasing loads and high-paying jobs or face an undesirable turnaround decline. As a recruiter, I've worked with clients that have enjoyed growth and success only to have poor business decisions made by unqualified utility leaders result in dramatic rate increases, financial distress, poor customer service, safety related incidents, and/or declining reliability. The lucky communities see those same villagers storming the castle demanding change. The unlucky ones see an exodus of load, resulting in the loss of high-paying jobs and declining payments-in-lieu of taxes.

Poor and declining communities have an even more difficult situation. Leaders that are courageous and act to improve the situation face criticism for hiring qualified leaders and staff at compensation levels that are among the highest in the community. Critics wonder why the community would hire a highly paid utility leader rather than put the money into schools. Other leaders succumb to the temptation to kick the can down the road and avoid that criticism.

Therein lies one of public power's biggest challenges. It is governed by individuals facing a two or four-year election cycle while administering an industry with a 15- to 30-year planning cycle.

A well-run utility requires well-paid employees.

Myth: Tax-exempt bonds are the reason public power borrowing costs are low.

Public power utilities finance large capital investments with municipal bonds. It is true that tax-exemption for municipal bonds reduces borrowing costs for public power utilities. But, it is also true that accelerated depreciation, tax-exempt private activity bonds, investment and production tax credits, and reduced tax rates on dividends and capital gains reduce the cost of capital for investor-owned utilities by a roughly comparable amount.

Where public power utilities really stand out is in the quality of debt issued. These high bond ratings result in lower interest rates. A key factor in determining a utility's bond rating is the strength – including tenure and experience – of its management team. Likewise, reliability – also driven by experience and expertise at all levels – is hugely important.

Yet another reason to hire wisely and pay well.